

Copyright 1999 Hugo van der Merwe
All Rights Reserved

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This dissertation was made possible thanks to funding provided by the Jennings Randolph Program of the United States Institute of Peace as well as scholarships provided by George Mason University.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
List of Tables	vii
List of Figures	viii
List of Abbreviations	ix
Abstract	x
1. Introduction	1
Introduction.....	1
Competing Conceptions of Reconciliation	2
Reconciliation as a Component of Peace-Building	5
International Interest in Transitional Justice and Reconciliation	7
The South African Context	10
The Research Process	18
The Structure of the Dissertation	19
Conclusion	22
2. Reconciliation: The Theoretical Context	24
Introduction	24
Reconciliation and Conflict Resolution/Peace Building	25
The Meaning of Relationship: Spheres of Reconciliation	36
Dimensions of Reconciliation	48
Components of Reconciliation: Substantive Issues of the Process	53
Components of Reconciliation: An Overview	60
Reconciliation as Interactive Process	69
Levels of Reconciliation	77
Competing Approaches and Ideological Frames of Reconciliation	80
Top-Down Versus Bottom-Up Approaches	86
Conclusion	91
3. Top-Down Versus Bottom-Up Approaches to Justice	94
Introduction	94

Functions of Justice.....	97
Competing Perspectives of Justice: Paradigm, Culture and Ideology	104
Justice as Situational or Individual Response	111
Rectificatory Justice and Reconciliation	117
Conclusion.....	122
4. International Experience: Tensions Inherent in National Reconciliation and Transitional Justice Initiatives	125
Introduction	125
Context for Formulating National Reconciliation Policies	127
Justice	133
Conclusion	155
5. South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission: Development, Structure and Goals	159
Introduction	159
Establishment of the TRC in South Africa	160
TRC: Resolution of Key Controversies	180
Structures and Procedures of the TRC	186
TRC's Mandate: How Did it Understand its Goals and Mission	195
Conclusion	198
6. Context of Community Reconciliation: Two Case Studies	200
Introduction	200
Political Conflict at the Local Level in South Africa	201
Community Studies	210
Conclusion	221
7. Research Methodology	223
Introduction	223
Conceptual Framework for the Research	224
Operationalization of the Research Framework	228
Operationalization of the Research Questions	237
The Research Subject and Methodology	244
Limitations of Interviewee Categorizations	262
Researcher Identity and Bias	264
Conclusion	268
8. Contestation of Reconciliation Strategies: Individual Case Management	270
Introduction	270
Interviewee Categorization	271
Contested Issues in Relation to Case Management Strategy	273

Stakeholder Divisions over Case Management Strategy	319
9. Contestation of Reconciliation Strategies: Community Engagement	324
Introduction	324
Contested Issues in Relation to Community Engagement	325
Stakeholder Divisions over Community Engagement Strategy	393
Conclusion: Contestation and Agreement regarding Strategies	397
10. Principles of Reconciliation.....	402
Introduction	402
Competing Principles of Reconciliation: The Conceptual Framework	403
Principles of Reconciliation Identified in the Data	405
Stakeholder Divisions around Principles	457
Linking Principles to Dimensions of Reconciliation	460
Conclusion	465
11. Ideological Frames of Reconciliation	467
Introduction	467
Ideological Frames of Reconciliation: The Conceptual Framework	468
Ideological Frames Identified in the Data	471
Linkages between Ideological Frames and Principles	494
Stakeholder Divisions over Ideological Frames	496
Conclusion	498
12. The TRC and the Community: Competing Conceptions of Justice	501
Introduction	501
Competing Perspectives on Justice	502
Individual Differences	512
Restorative Justice and the TRC	515
The Effectiveness of Restorative Justice in Promoting Reconciliation	527
Conclusion	534
13. Conclusions	537
Introduction	537
Competing Ideological Frames	538
The TRC as a Mechanism for Promoting Reconciliation	541
TRC's Contribution to Community Reconciliation	547
Problematizing Reconciliation as a Theoretical Consideration	553
Relevance of Findings to Commissions in Other Countries	557
Conclusion	564
Appendix A - Overview of Interview Data	565
Appendix B - Interview Schedules	570
Bibliography	593

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
7.1 Respondents According to Interviewee Category	
254	
8.1 Stakeholder Divisions over Case Management Strategies	
320	
9.1 Stakeholder Divisions over Community Engagement Strategies	394
9.2 Number of Contested Issues among Stakeholders	399
9.3 Number of Commonalities in Strategic Positions of Stakeholde	
400	
10.1 Stakeholder Divisions over Principles	458
11.1 Connections between Ideological Frames and Principles	495
11.2 Ideological Frames and Stakeholders	496
12.1 Top-Down versus Bottom-Up Models of Restorative Justice	524

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
2.1 Structure as Cause of Conflict	27
2.2 Nested View of Conflict	29
2.3 Relationships as Cause	30
2.4 Spheres of Reconciliation	41
2.5 Components of Reconciliation	51
2.6 Spheres and Components of Reconciliation	51
2.7 Levels of Reconciliation	52
2.8 Three-Dimensional Model of Reconciliation	53
2.9 Lederach's Components of Reconciliation	55
2.10 Shriver's Components of Reconciliation	56
2.11 Ideological Frames of Reconciliation	85
3.1 Levels and Components of Reconciliation	95
3.2 Levels of Justice	95
3.3 Vidmar and Miller's Purposes Underlying Punishment Reactions	100
3.4 A Classification of Purposes Underlying Punishment Reactions	102
3.5 Conditions for Reconciliation under Punitive Justice	119
7.1 Construction and Analysis of Ideological Frames and Principles	229
7.2 Framework for Analyzing Competing Strategies	230
7.3 Factors Impacting on Conceptions of Reconciliation	233
7.4 Contrasting Community and TRC Conceptions of Reconciliation	234
7.5 Contrasting Conceptions of Reconciliation in Relation to Location	236

Abbreviations

ANC	- African National Congress
ANCYL	- ANC Youth League
AWB	- Afrikaner Weerstandsbeweging (Afrikaner Resistance Movement)
COSAS	- Congress of South African Students
CPF	- Community Police Forum
CSVR	- Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation
IFP	- Inkatha Freedom Party
KP (CP)	- Conservative Party
MK	- Umkhonto we Sizwe (military wing of the ANC)
NGO	- Non-Governmental Organization
NP	- National Party
RDP	- Reconstruction and Development Programme (official government policy paper outlining development priorities)
SACC	- South African Council of Churches
SACP	- South African Communist Party
SANCO	- South African National Civic Association
SDU	- Self Defense Unit (ANC aligned structure)
SPU	- Self Protection Unit (IFP aligned structure)

South African Terms

Askaris	- ex-MK members who became state operatives
civic	- local community organization that mobilized residents around local political issues in the 1980s, generally with claims of not being affiliated to particular political parties but generally seen as ANC-aligned
Comrades	- young political activists affiliated to the ANC
Induna	- Zulu word for traditional leaders - held political power in the IFP
township	(or location, or community) terms which all refer to African residential neighborhood (sometimes it is used simply as a geographic term, but often also with the connotation of a sense of community among its residents)

African, white, coloured, Indian are used in the text to refer to the various population groups differentiated by the apartheid government. The term “black” is used to refer collectively to Africans, coloureds and Indians - those subjected to racial discrimination by the state.